Report on the 2023 Annual Review of Low-Producing Programs

In 2013, the Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board (THECB) began issuing recommendations for closure or consolidation to institutions' governing boards for degree programs that have consistently produced low numbers of graduates. The THECB posts a list of these degree programs on its website (www.highered.texas.gov/LPP). The list includes degree programs identified as low producing, based on the annual Low-Producing Degree Program (LPP) review. The THECB also publishes an annual report of degree programs that have been on the list of low-producing programs for three or more consecutive years.

The rules for the annual review of graduates of degree programs from Texas public institutions of higher education are in Texas Administrative Code (TAC), Title 19, Chapter 4, Subchapter R, Rules 4.285-4.290. The rules are based on Texas Education Code, Chapter 61, Subchapter C, Section 61.0512 (f), which authorizes the THECB to make recommendations for consolidation or closure of degree programs.

The TAC defines the process THECB staff follow to determine which programs are low producing. In order for a degree program to be identified as low producing, the number of its graduates is, over a cumulative five-year period:
- fewer than 25 graduates for undergraduate degree programs;
- fewer than 15 graduates for master's degree programs; and
- fewer than 10 graduates for doctoral degree programs.

New degree programs are exempt from the low-producing review for the first five years of operation. The first review to determine whether a program is low producing is done in year eleven, as the first five years are exempt, and the LPP review requires five consecutive years of data regarding the number of program graduates.

Academic associate degree programs are exempted from LPP review because they are intended to give students a pathway from two-year institutions into baccalaureate programs.

The number of graduates of applied associate degree programs and corresponding career technical certificate programs are combined by program CIP code for LPP purposes. Certificate programs are not affected by THECB recommendations based on the LPP review of applied associate degree programs.

Master's degree programs that lead directly to a doctoral degree are exempted from LPP review. These degrees are available to students who initially purse a doctoral degree but are unable to meet doctoral degree requirements.

The 2023 Annual Review of Low-Producing Degree Programs

The 2023 report of the low-producing degree programs review includes graduates of programs from Academic Year (AY) 2016 through AY 2022. Approximately 5,500 degree programs were reviewed, and 203 degree programs were identified as low-producing.

Of the 203 programs identified as low-producing, 123 programs have been low producing for three or more consecutive reviews. The 2022 report identified about the same number of programs, 126 programs, as low producing for three or more consecutive reviews. Of those degree programs, 6 were closed or consolidated at the request of their institution during the following year, and 19 increased the number of graduates and were no longer low producing.

LPP Action	2019 Review	2020 Review	2021 Review	2022 Review	2023 Review
Review of three 5-year periods	AY 12-18	AY 13-19	AY 14-20	AY 15-21	AY 16-22
Total LPP	182	196	194	195	203
LPP three years in a row	99	113	121	126	123
Sufficient graduates the following year to not be LPP	16	10	16	19	NA*
Closed or consolidated the following year	7	12	8	6	NA*
Recommended for close-out #	97	76	120	97	123
Percent of Programs reported on LAR	51%		78%		

*   NA, not available at this time: number of programs closing or consolidating in response to the AY 2023 review, programs with increased numbers of graduates the following year, and percentage of programs reported on LAR in response to the AY 2023 review.

\#   New recommendations are made only in odd-numbered review years. Recommendations in even-numbered review years are carried forward from the previous year.

Actions Following the Low-Producing Degree Program Review

THECB staff alerts an institution's governing board each year when a degree program has not met the minimum standard of graduates for three consecutive years, i.e., when it was low producing for three consecutive years of review. Notification to governing boards is sent following the April board meeting of the THECB.

The THECB is authorized to make recommendations to close or consolidate low-producing degree programs. Recommendations to close or consolidate are made for non-exempt degree programs that have been on the annual list of low-producing degree programs for three or more consecutive reviews. The recommendations are made to the governing board of a public system of higher education, or to the governing board of a public institution of higher education where a system does not exist.

The THECB makes recommendations to systems' and institutions' governing boards for closure or consolidation of low-producing degree programs in **odd-numbered years**. This allows systems and institutions ample time to decide on appropriate action, in the year prior to the submission of their Legislative Appropriation Request (LAR), which is done in **even-numbered years**.

In response to the THECB's recommendation, the system (or the institution, where a system does not exist), may close a low-producing program, consolidated the program with one or more other programs, or may retain the program. Staff welcomes working with institution representatives on questions regarding graduate count, related issues regarding the history of program changes, and data reporting.

Recommendations to Close or Consolidate Low-Producing Degree Programs

The list of low-producing degree programs includes programs that had been recommended for closure or consolidation in AY 2019 and AY 2021 but have not been closed or consolidated and have not sufficiently increased the number of graduates. The list of low-producing programs on the 2019 report was approved by the Board of the THECB at its April 2019 meeting, and the list on the 2021 report was approved by the Board of the THECB at its April 2021 meeting. This year's 2023 report includes additional programs with new recommendations to close and consolidate.

The low-producing programs that were recommended to be closed or consolidated in the 2019 and 2021 reports and those that are newly recommended with this 2023 report are identified on the list for this report. If LPP programs are not closed or consolidated, institutions must list their identified programs in the LAR for the 2026-27 biennium, in calendar year 2022. Institutions listed 78% of programs that qualified to be reported on the 2022 LAR for the 2024-25 biennium. This low reporting may be partially attributed to the relative newness of the reporting requirement and because some programs that had been listed on the previous LAR were not re-listed, even though the programs are still active, low producing, and remain recommended for consolidation or closure.

Low-Producing Programs Identified for Three or More Consecutive Years			Review Year			Recommendation For Action	
Academic Year 2023 Review			AY 21	AY 22	AY 23		
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five Year Periods			First Year	2024-25 LAR[1]
Non-System - Community and Technical Colleges							
Angelina College	Diagnostic Medical Sonography/Sonographer and Ultrasound Technician	AAS	21	18	21	2019	NR
Blinn College District	Surgical Technology/Technologist	AAS	12	16	19	2023	--
Central Texas College	Computer Engineering Technologies/Technicians	AAS	16	8	8	2023	--
Grayson College	Air Transportation	AAS	0	0	0	2023	--
Hill College	Heavy/Industrial Equipment Maintenance Technologies/Technicians	AAS	12	21	22	2017	NR
Kilgore College	Surgical Technology/Technologist	AAS	21	13	1	2023	--
Lee College	Criminal Justice and Corrections, General	AAS	17	12	11	2017	NR
Navarro College	Design and Applied Arts	AAS	22	14	6	2023	--
Northeast Texas Community College	Dental Support Services and Allied Professions	AAS	0	0	0	2023	--

[1] Biennium for which the low-producing program had to be identified on a system's or institution's Legislative Appropriation Request (LAR), accessed at http://www.lbb.state.tx.us/. "✓" means the program was reported on the LAR; "NR" means the program was not reported; "--" means that reporting was not required. If not closed, consolidated, or improved, all programs recommended for closure or consolidation must be identified on the next LAR, for the 2026-27 biennium.

Low-Producing Programs Identified for Three or More Consecutive Years			Review Year			Recommendation For Action	
Academic Year 2023 Review			AY 21	AY 22	AY 23		
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five Year Periods			First Year	2024-25 LAR
Non-System - Community and Technical Colleges							
Paris Junior College	Electrical/Electronic Engineering Technologies/Technicians	AAS	22	10	1	2023	--
Paris Junior College	Business Administration, Management and Operations	AAS	19	19	18	2023	--
Paris Junior College	Business Operations Support and Assistant Services	AAS	19	11	10	2023	--
Tarrant County College District	Computer Engineering Technologies/Technicians	AAS	0	0	0	2023	--
Temple College	Computer and Information Sciences, General	AAS	23	16	16	2023	--
Temple College	Biology/Biotechnology Technologies/Technicians	AAS	5	3	2	2021	NR
Texarkana College	Marketing	AAS	0	0	0	2017	NR
Trinity Valley Community College	Fire Protection	AAS	24	24	20	2023	--
Alamo Community College District							
Alamo Community College District - Northwest Vista College	Health and Medical Administrative Services	AAS	16	16	23	2021	NR
Howard County Junior College District							
Howard College-Southwest Collegiate Institute for the Deaf	American Sign Language	AAS	18	13	10	2021	NR

Low-Producing Programs Identified for Three or More Consecutive Years			Review Year			Recommendation For Action	
Academic Year 2023 Review			AY 21	AY 22	AY 23		
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five Year Periods			First Year	2024-25 LAR
Non-System - Universities							
Stephen F. Austin State University	Forestry	PHD	6	3	5	2017	✓
Stephen F. Austin State University	Art Education	MA	3	2	3	2023	--
Stephen F. Austin State University	Philosophy	BA	9	9	8	2019	✓
Stephen F. Austin State University	Public Administration	BA BS	16	16	18	2021	✓
Stephen F. Austin State University	Economics	BA	7	7	6	2017	✓
Texas Southern University	Spanish	BA	16	15	13	2017	NR
Texas Southern University	Mathematics	MS	0	0	7	2021	NR
Texas Southern University	Chemistry	MS	13	12	13	2023	--
Texas Southern University	Nutritional Sciences and Dietetics	BS	10	4	2	2023	--
Texas A&M University System							
Prairie View A&M University	Clinical Adolescent Psychology	PHD	5	5	9	2017	✓
Tarleton State University	Performance	BM	13	16	17	2023	--
Texas A&M University	Agricultural Economics	MAGR	0	0	0	2023	--
Texas A&M University	Veterinary Public Health-Epidemiology	MS	11	13	13	2023	--
Texas A&M University	Applied Physics	PHD	9	7	8	2023	--
Texas A&M University-Central Texas	Political Science	MA	9	5	5	2023	--
Texas A&M University-Commerce	Political Science	MA MS	14	12	7	2023	--

Low-Producing Programs Identified for Three or More Consecutive Years			Review Year			Recommendation For Action	
Academic Year 2023 Review			AY 21	AY 22	AY 23		
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five Year Periods			First Year	2024-25 LAR
Texas A&M University System							
Texas A&M University-Corpus Christi	Early Childhood Education	MS	10	10	8	2021	✓
Texas A&M University-Kingsville	Spanish	BA	12	15	16	2021	✓
Texas A&M University-Kingsville	Applied Arts and Sciences	BAAS	19	16	16	2023	--
Texas A&M University-Kingsville	General Business Administration	BBA	17	15	15	2021	✓
Texas A&M University-Texarkana	School Counseling	MS	9	5	6	2021	NR
Texas A&M University-Texarkana	History	MS	10	10	12	2021	✓
West Texas A&M University	Social Sciences	BA BS	10	5	6	2023	--
West Texas A&M University	Art	BA BS	23	24	24	2017	✓
West Texas A&M University	Studio Art	MFA	12	12	10	2017	✓
Texas State University System							
Lamar State College-Orange	Physical Therapist Assistant	AAS	0	0	0	2023	--
Lamar University	Environmental Studies	MS	5	4	5	2017	✓
Lamar University	Advertising	BBA	10	11	7	2017	✓
Lamar University	Biochemistry	BA	11	13	16	2019	✓

Low-Producing Programs Identified for Three or More Consecutive Years			Review Year			Recommendation For Action	
Academic Year 2023 Review			AY 21	AY 22	AY 23		
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five Year Periods			First Year	2024-25 LAR
Texas State University System							
Lamar University	Forensic Chemistry	BS	6	9	8	2019	✓
Lamar University	Earth Science/Geology	BS	22	18	23	2023	--
Lamar University	Music-Music Business	BA	0	0	0	2019	✓
Lamar University	Retail Merchandising	BBA	3	2	3	2017	✓
Lamar University	History	MA	14	13	11	2017	✓
Sam Houston State University	Family and Consumer Sciences	MS	5	2	0	2017	NR
Sam Houston State University	Food Service Management	BA BS	22	19	17	2023	--
Sam Houston State University	Composite Science	BS	1	4	4	2017	✓
Sul Ross State University	Industrial Technology	BS	7	13	14	2017	✓
Sul Ross State University	Spanish	BA	4	5	5	2017	✓
Sul Ross State University	English	BA	17	17	23	2021	✓
Sul Ross State University	English	MA	10	5	5	2021	✓
Sul Ross State University	Theatre	BFA	16	21	22	2017	✓
Sul Ross State University	Liberal Arts	MA	11	11	8	2023	--
Sul Ross State University	Mathematics	BS	10	9	9	2017	✓
Sul Ross State University	Interdisciplinary Studies	BA	1	1	1	2023	--

Low-Producing Programs Identified for Three or More Consecutive Years			Review Year			Recommendation For Action	
Academic Year 2023 Review			AY 21	AY 22	AY 23		
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five Year Periods			First Year	2024-25 LAR
Texas State University System							
Sul Ross State University	Chemistry	BS	3	3	3	2017	✓
Sul Ross State University	Psychology	MA	0	0	0	2017	✓
Sul Ross State University	Social Science	BA	3	2	1	2017	✓
Sul Ross State University	Political Science	BA	7	6	7	2017	✓
Sul Ross State University	Political Science	MA	4	3	6	2017	✓
Sul Ross State University	Art	BFA	16	17	20	2017	✓
Sul Ross State University	Art	MA	3	2	3	2017	NR
Sul Ross State University	Music	BM	13	11	9	2017	✓
Sul Ross State University Rio Grande College	Reading	MED	7	8	8	2017	✓
Sul Ross State University Rio Grande College	Biology	BS	19	17	16	2019	✓
Sul Ross State University Rio Grande College	Mathematics	BS	14	17	20	2019	✓
Sul Ross State University Rio Grande College	Interdisciplinary Studies	BS	0	0	0	2023	--
Sul Ross State University Rio Grande College	Social Science	BA	11	13	9	2017	✓

Low-Producing Programs Identified for Three or More Consecutive Years			Review Year			Recommendation For Action	
Academic Year 2023 Review			AY 21	AY 22	AY 23		
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five Year Periods			First Year	2024-25 LAR
Texas Tech University System							
Angelo State University	Food Animal Science and Marketing	BS	13	12	13	2023	--
Midwestern State University	Humanities	BA	10	8	7	2019	✓
Midwestern State University	Global Studies	BA	20	18	19	2019	✓
Texas Tech University	Land Use Planning, Management, and Design	PHD	5	3	4	2017	✓
Texas Tech University	Instructional Technology	EDD	7	9	6	2023	--
Texas Tech University	Language/Literacy Education	MED	0	0	1	2021	✓
Texas Tech University	Multidisciplinary Science	BS	19	16	15	2021	✓
Texas Tech University	Interdisciplinary Arts Studies	BA	5	10	14	2019	NR
Texas Woman's University System							
Texas Woman's University	School Counseling	MED	0	0	0	2023	--
Texas Woman's University	Political Science	MA	8	7	8	2023	--
The University of Texas System							
The University of Texas at Arlington	Public Policy	MPP	10	9	7	2023	--
The University of Texas at Arlington	Medical Technology	BS	24	23	24	2023	--

Low-Producing Programs Identified for Three or More Consecutive Years			Review Year			Recommendation For Action	
Academic Year 2023 Review			AY 21	AY 22	AY 23		
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five Year Periods			First Year	2024-25 LAR
The University of Texas System							
The University of Texas at Austin	Architectural History	MA	2	4	2	2017	✓
The University of Texas at Austin	European Studies	BA	18	15	15	2021	✓
The University of Texas at Austin	Italian Studies	BA	12	11	12	2017	✓
The University of Texas at Austin	Italian Studies	PHD	8	7	5	2023	--
The University of Texas at Austin	Portuguese	BA	8	4	2	2021	✓
The University of Texas at Austin	Jewish Studies	BA	5	6	5	2017	✓
The University of Texas at Austin	Dance	MFA	3	3	6	2017	✓
The University of Texas at Austin	Composition	BM	9	11	10	2017	✓
The University of Texas at Austin	Jazz	BM	22	22	23	2017	✓
The University of Texas at Austin	International Business	BBA	0	0	0	2021	✓
The University of Texas at Dallas	American Studies	BA	22	16	13	2023	--
The University of Texas at Dallas	Latin American Studies	MA	4	3	3	2023	--
The University of Texas at El Paso	Engineering	MS	9	10	7	2023	--
The University of Texas at El Paso	French	BA	21	14	10	2023	--
The University of Texas at El Paso	Interdisciplinary Studies	MAIS	13	14	12	2023	--
The University of Texas at El Paso	Philosophy	MA	11	13	13	2023	--
The University of Texas at El Paso	Geophysics	BS	1	0	2	2017	NR

Low-Producing Programs Identified for Three or More Consecutive Years			Review Year			Recommendation For Action	
Academic Year 2023 Review			AY 21	AY 22	AY 23		
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five Year Periods			First Year	2024-25 LAR
The University of Texas System							
The University of Texas at El Paso	Clinical Psychology	MA	12	11	13	2023	--
The University of Texas at San Antonio	Mathematics Education	MS	13	12	11	2023	--
The University of Texas at San Antonio	Art History	MA	9	7	5	2021	✓
The University of Texas Health Science Center at San Antonio	Dental Hygiene	MS	11	10	10	2023	--
The University of Texas Health Science Center at San Antonio	Medical Health Physics	MS	1	2	2	2019	✓
The University of Texas M.D. Anderson Cancer Center	Cytotechnology	BS	10	10	19	2021	✓
The University of Texas Medical Branch at Galveston	Clinical Science	PHD	3	3	3	2021	✓
The University of Texas Medical Branch at Galveston	Population Health Sciences	MS	1	0	0	2021	NR
The University of Texas Permian Basin	Information Systems	BS	22	23	19	2017	✓

Low-Producing Programs Identified for Three or More Consecutive Years			Review Year			Recommendation For Action	
Academic Year 2023 Review			AY 21	AY 22	AY 23		
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five Year Periods			First Year	2024-25 LAR
The University of Texas System							
The University of Texas Permian Basin	Spanish	MA	2	6	11	2021	✓
The University of Texas Permian Basin	Biology	MS	7	7	11	2019	✓
The University of Texas Permian Basin	Criminal Justice Administration	MS	7	7	13	2021	✓
The University of Texas Permian Basin	Athletic Training	BS	16	18	17	2021	NR
The University of Texas Permian Basin	History	MA	8	10	11	2021	✓
University of Houston System							
University of Houston	Architectural Studies	MA	6	5	5	2023	--
University of Houston	Engineering Management	MEMGMT	0	6	14	2017	NR
University of North Texas System							
University of North Texas	English as a Second Language	MA	6	7	7	2023	--