

UNTHSC/TCU MD Proposal: Summary of Staff Perspectives



Stacey Silverman, Ph.D.
Academic Quality and Workforce
September 27, 2018



Summary of Staff Perspectives

Staff recommendation is Approval (with two additional recommendations)

- The proposed program would prepare physicians for the region.
- The proposed program's budget depends on a mix of tuition and fees, reallocation of institutional funds, and donations.
- The institutions have strong supporting academic programs, existing faculty, and physical and administrative infrastructure necessary to develop, implement, and sustain a high-quality program.
- UNTHSC submitted a **specific** plan regarding how the institution will provide sufficient first-year residency positions for graduates, pursuant to the provisions and intent of SB 1066, 85th Legislature, Regular Session.



Statutory Requirements on Degree Reviews

- TEC 61.0512 states that, “the board may not summarily disapprove a program without completing the review required by this section.”
- Statute specifies four criteria the proposed program **must** meet during the review. Statute does **not** limit the Coordinating Board to considering **only** these criteria in deciding whether to approve the degree program (per TEC, 61.0512(c)(4)).
- The staff review of this and all program proposals **incorporates these criteria broadly as well as specific factors established in the Texas Administrative Code, such as workforce demand, student financial assistance, and library and IT resources, to fully inform the Board.**

The Coordinating Board is statutorily directed to consider ***at least*** the following four criteria when reviewing program proposals

Per TEC 61.0512

(c) The board shall review each degree or certificate program offered by an institution of higher education at the time the institution requests to implement a new program to ensure that the program:

- (1) is **needed by the state and the local community** and **does not unnecessarily duplicate programs** offered by other institutions of higher education or private or independent institutions of higher education;
- (2) has **adequate financing** from legislative appropriation, funds allocated by the board, or funds from other sources;
- (3) has **necessary faculty** and **other resources to ensure student success**; and
- (4) **meets academic standards** specified by law or prescribed by board rule, including rules adopted by the board for purposes of this section.

Statutory Criterion 1: *“The program is needed by the state and the local community and does not unnecessarily duplicate programs offered by other institutions of higher education or private or independent institutions of higher education.”*

Staff Perspective: Proposed program partially meets the criterion

- Texas expanded medical education and in 2017 surpassed Pennsylvania with the second largest entering medical school class size
- Texas ranked 36th nationally in the ratio of medical students per 100,000 population
- Fort Worth is home to UNTHSC, Texas College of Osteopathic Medicine
- Dallas is home to one mature medical school
- Texas A&M University Health Science Center has a partnership with Baylor University Medical Center Dallas, which serves as one of its training sites for some of its medical students

Statutory Criterion 1: *“The program is needed by the state and the local community and does not unnecessarily duplicate programs offered by other institutions of higher education or private or independent institutions of higher education.”*

Staff Perspective: Proposed program partially meets the criterion

- There is a need for **more physicians in Texas**
- There are needs for improved geographic distribution in **specific regions, including inner-city and rural areas**
- It is evident from the information provided in the proposal and subsequent information that the proposed program would address these needs:
 - ✓ Have strong community support as evidenced through its partnership relationship with TCU
 - ✓ Combine the strengths of two existing institutions
 - ✓ Implement current educational elements, including a flipped classroom approach, longitudinal experiences in patient care, and research through a required thesis
 - ✓ Develop physicians who embody the 9 characteristics of “empathetic scholars”: teachable, altruistic, mentally balanced, collaborative, empathetic, humble, insightful, professional integrity, and respectful

Statutory Criterion 2: *“The program has adequate financing from legislative appropriation, funds allocated by the board, or funds from other sources.”*

Staff Perspective: Proposed program meets the criterion

- UNTHSC/TCU's proposed program is **dependent on a mixed funding model**. The mix includes a reliance on state funding through the Higher Education Fund, TCU's financial support (\$44 million over the first five years), high-cost tuition and fees, and donations
- The proposed program would set tuition and fees at \$60,000 annually, which is a high-cost tuition and fee model and is much higher than other state medical schools
- The proposed program received a **donation of \$3.2 million**, which would cover tuition and fees for the inaugural class for the first year
- The institutions commit to continued fundraising efforts with a goal to cover 15 percent of all students' tuition and fees
- UNTHSC would **not** seek formula funding for students in the proposed MD program

Recommendation: UNTHC/TCU commit to providing financial support to cover 50 percent of tuition and fees for students with demonstrated financial need

Recommendation: UNTHSC will not seek formula funding for the proposed program

Statutory Criterion 3: *“The program has necessary faculty and other resources to ensure student success.”*

Staff Perspective: Proposed program meets the criterion

- UNTHSC, Texas College of Osteopathic Medicine has offered the Doctor of Osteopathic Medicine program **since 1974**
- The institution has **32 core** and **80 support faculty** in place
- UNTHSC offers doctoral degree programs in **several health-related fields**, including pharmacy, public health, and physical therapy
- UNTHSC has **expertise** in hiring the necessary high-quality faculty
- UNTHSC has **existing space** in a new building that will house the MD students with plans to build a new building

Statutory Criterion 4: *“The program meets academic standards specified by law or prescribed by board rule, including rules adopted by the board for purposes of this section. . .”*

Staff Perspective: Proposed program meets this criterion

Under THECB Rule 5.46, “requests for new doctoral programs must provide information and documentation demonstrating that the proposed programs **meet all of the following criteria.**”

There are 19 criteria total under this section.

- Design of the proposed program
- Freedom of inquiry and expression
- Programs at the undergraduate and master’s levels
- Need for the program
- Faculty resources
- Teaching loads of faculty
- Critical mass of superior students
- On-campus residency expectations
- Adequate financial assistance
- Carefully planned program
- External learning experiences
- Support staff
- Physical facilities
- Library and IT Resources
- Costs and funding
- Program evaluation standards
- Strategic plan
- Marketable skills, and
- First doctoral program requires SACSCOC notification



Statutory Criterion 4: *“The program meets academic standards specified by law or prescribed by board rule, including rules adopted by the board for purposes of this section. . .”*

Staff Perspective: Proposed program meets the criterion

The proposal meets THECB Rule 5.46(3): “Doctoral programs, in most instances, should be undergirded by quality programs in a wide number of disciplines at the undergraduate and master’s levels. Quality programs in **other related and supporting doctoral areas must** also be available.”

- UNTHSC offers PhD programs in the related and supporting areas of biomedical sciences, and public health sciences
- UNTHSC offers special professional degree programs in the related and supporting areas of osteopathic medicine, pharmacy, physical therapy, and public health
- The institution offers master’s level programs in biomedical sciences, biostatistics, epidemiology, lifestyle health, health, community health, and environmental and occupational health sciences



Statutory Criterion 4: *“The program meets academic standards specified by law or prescribed by board rule, including rules adopted by the board for purposes of this section. . .”*

Staff Perspective: Proposed program meets the criterion

THECB Rule 5.46(5)(A): “If an institution is required to hire additional faculty prior to opening the proposed program and enrolling students, the institution **will provide documentation on a schedule determined** by the Coordinating Board of the faculty hires through submission of a letter of intent, curriculum vitae, and a list of courses in the curriculum that the faculty hire would be qualified to teach. **Proposed recruitment of such faculty shall not meet this criterion.** No authorized doctoral program shall be initiated until qualified faculty are active members of the department through which the program is offered.”

Statutory Criterion 4: *“The program meets academic standards specified by law or prescribed by board rule, including rules adopted by the board for purposes of this section. . .”*

Staff Perspective: Proposed program meets the criterion

Rule 5.46(9): “There should be adequate financial assistance for doctoral students so as to assure that most of them can be engaged in full-time study. **Initially, funds for financial assistance to the doctoral students usually come from institutional sources.** As the program develops and achieves distinction, it increasingly shall attract support from government, industry, foundations, and other sources.”

- The proposal provided clear communication that the institutions would provide financial support for its inaugural class to cover tuition and fees for their first year
- UNTHSC/TCU received a \$3.2 million donation which will cover the tuition and fees of their inaugural class for their first year

Recommendation: UNTHSC/TCU commit to providing financial support to cover 50 percent of tuition and fees for students with demonstrated financial need

HCR 102, 85th Texas Legislature, Regular Session

(Author: Chairman J.M. Lozano

Senate Sponsor: Senator Charles Schwertner)

**HCR 102 (Passed the Texas Senate 31-0, Passed the Texas House 134-12;
Signed by the Governor on 6/15/17)**

- Expresses the Legislature's support for **prioritizing a substantial increase in funding for graduate medical education** before it considers authorizing the creation and support of additional medical schools.
- Charges the Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board to work with institutions of higher education and the medical community to **achieve the 1.1 to 1 goal** for graduate medical education.
- Texas is **currently just at the 1.1 to 1 ratio** of first-year residency positions to medical school graduates. It will require **an additional \$60.675 million** in GME Expansion Grant funding next biennium just to keep up with additional graduates **from currently operating medical schools**.



13

SB 1066, 85th Texas Legislature, Regular Session

(Authors: Senators Schwertner, Buckingham, Campbell, Huffman, Nelson

Co-Authors: Bettencourt, Hinojosa, Kolkhorst, Seliger, Zaffirini)

**SB 1066 (Approved in the Texas Senate 31-0, Unopposed in the Texas House;
Signed by the Governor on 6/12/17)**

- Requires an institution proposing an M.D. or D.O. degree to provide a **"specific plan regarding the addition of first-year residency positions** for the graduate medical education program to be offered in connection with the new degree program."
- The **plan must propose an increase in the total number of first-year residency positions in the state sufficient to reasonably accommodate their and other medical schools' projected graduates.**
- **Submission of such a specific plan is required for approval.**



14

SB 1066, 85th Texas Legislature, Regular Session

(Authors: Senators Schwertner, Buckingham, Campbell, Huffman, Nelson
Co-Authors: Bettencourt, Hinojosa, Kolkhorst, Seliger, Zaffirini)

Staff Perspective: Proposal offers a specific plan

- Given that UNTHSC/TCU proposes to enroll MD students in fall 2019, **a minimum of 60 newly established first-year residency positions would be needed in 2023.**
- The proposal **included signed agreements with HCA Medical Center Healthcare to establish new residency programs** in its hospitals in the area.
- The proposal includes development by 2023 of **130 to 200** first-year residency positions in the region.
- **The proposal also included signed agreements with** 17 hospitals and ambulatory practices in the area for its clerkship experiences.

Staff Recommendations

Staff recommendation is Approval with two additional recommendations

Recommendation 1: UNTHSC/TCU commit to providing financial support to cover 50 percent of tuition and fees for students with demonstrated financial need

Recommendation 2: UNTHSC will not seek formula funding for the proposed program