

## Report on the 2020 Annual Review of Low-Producing Programs

Beginning in 2013, the Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board (THECB) issues recommendations for closure or consolidation to institutions' governing boards for degree programs that have consistently produced low numbers of graduates. The THECB posts a list of these degree programs on its website ([www.thecb.state.tx.us/LPP](http://www.thecb.state.tx.us/LPP)). The list includes degree programs identified as low producing, based on the annual Low-Producing Degree Program (LPP) review of degree programs. The THECB also publishes an annual report of degree programs that have been on the list of low-producing programs for three or more consecutive years.

The rules for the annual review of graduates of degree program from Texas public institutions of higher education are in Texas Administrative Code (TAC), Title 19, Chapter 4, Subchapter R, Rules 4.285-4.290. The rules are based on Texas Education Code, Chapter 61, Subchapter C, Section 61.0512 (f), which authorizes the THECB to make recommendations for consolidation or closure of degree programs.

The TAC defines the process THECB staff follow to determine which programs are low producing. In order for a degree program to be identified as low producing, the number of its graduates is, over a cumulative five-year period:

- fewer than 25 graduates for undergraduate degree programs;
- fewer than 15 graduates for master's degree programs; and
- fewer than 10 graduates for doctoral degree programs.

New degree programs are exempt from the low-producing review for the first five years of operation. The first review to determine whether a program is low producing is done in year eleven, as the first five years are exempt, and the LPP review requires five consecutive years of data regarding the number of program graduates.

Academic associate degree programs are exempted from LPP review because they are intended to give students a pathway from two-year institutions into baccalaureate programs.

The number of graduates of applied associate degree programs and corresponding career technical certificate programs are combined by program CIP code for LPP purposes. Certificate programs are not affected by THECB recommendations based on the LPP review of applied associate degree programs.

Master's degree programs that lead directly to a doctoral degree are exempted from LPP review. These degrees are available to students who initially pursue a doctoral degree, but are unable to meet doctoral degree requirements.

### **The 2020 Annual Review of Low-Producing Degree Programs**

The 2020 report of the low-producing degree programs review includes graduates of programs from Academic Year (AY) 2013 through AY 2019. Approximately 5,800 degree programs were reviewed, and 193 degree programs were identified as low-producing.

Of the 193 programs identified as low-producing, 113 programs have been low producing for three or more consecutive reviews. The 2019 report identified about the same number of programs, 101 programs, as low producing for three or more consecutive reviews. Of those degree programs, 10 were closed or consolidated at the request of their institution during the following year, and 30 increased the number of graduates and were no longer low producing.

<b>LPP Action</b>	<b>2016 Review</b>	<b>2017 Review</b>	<b>2018 Review</b>	<b>2019 Review</b>	<b>2020 Review</b>
Review of three 5-year periods	<b>AY 09-15</b>	<b>AY 10-16</b>	<b>AY 11-17</b>	<b>AY 12-18</b>	<b>AY 12-18</b>
<b>Total LPP</b>	<b>178</b>	<b>190</b>	<b>206</b>	<b>182</b>	<b>193</b>
LPP three years in a row	54	118	112	101	113
Sufficient graduates the following year to not be LPP	26	33	43	30	NA*
Closed or consolidated the following year	15	8	31	10	NA*
Recommended for close-out	0	118	0	101	0

\* NA, not available at this time: number of programs closing or consolidating in response to the AY 2020 review, or programs with increased numbers of graduates the following year.

### **Actions Following the Low-Producing Degree Program Review**

THECB staff alerts an institution's governing board each year when a degree program has not met the minimum standard of graduates for three consecutive years, i.e., when it was low producing for three consecutive years of review. Notification to governing boards is sent following the April board meeting of the THECB.

The THECB is authorized to make recommendations to close or consolidate low-producing degree programs. Recommendations to close or consolidate are made for non-exempt degree programs that have been on the annual list of low-producing degree programs for three or more consecutive reviews. The recommendations are made to the governing board of a public system of higher education, or to the governing board of a public institution of higher education where a system does not exist.

The THECB makes recommendations to systems' and institutions' governing boards for closure or consolidation of low-producing degree programs in **odd-numbered years**. This allows systems and institutions ample time to decide on appropriate action, in the year prior to the submission of their Legislative Appropriation Request (LAR), which is done in **even-numbered years**.

In response to the THECB's recommendation, the system (or the institution, where a system does not exist), may close a low-producing program, consolidated the program with one or more other programs, or may retain the program. Staff welcomes working with institution representatives on questions regarding graduate count, related issues regarding the history of program changes, and data reporting.

## **Recommendations to Close or Consolidate Low-Producing Degree Programs**

The list of low-producing degree programs includes programs that had been recommended for closure or consolidation in AY 2017 and AY 2019 but have not been closed or consolidated and have not sufficiently increased the number of graduates. The list of low-producing programs of the 2017 report was approved by the Board of the THECB at its July 2017 meeting, and the list of the 2019 report was approved by the Board of the THECB at its April 2019 meeting.

The low-producing programs that were recommended to be closed or consolidated in the 2017 and 2019 reports are identified on the list for this report. *If they are not closed or consolidated in the meantime, institutions would list their identified programs with the LAR for the 2020-21 biennium.*

This year's list also includes programs identified as low-producing for three consecutive reviews during the 2020 review. *THECB staff does not recommend programs for closure or consolidation for these programs this year, because systems and institutions would not have time to decide on appropriate action prior to submission of their LAR for the 2020-21 biennium.*

Low-Producing Programs Identified for Three or More Consecutive Years Academic Year 2020 Review			Review Year			First Year of Recommendation <sup>1</sup>
			AY 18	AY 19	AY 20	
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five-Year Periods			
Non-System - Community and Technical Colleges						
Angelina College	Diagnostic Medical Sonography/Sonographer and Ultrasound Technician	AAS	14	20	13	2019
Austin Community College	International Business	AAS	17	22	23	2019
Brazosport College	Emergency Medical Technology/Technician (EMT Paramedic)	AAS	12	19	24	--
Hill College	Heavy/Industrial Equipment Maintenance Technologies	AAS	2	5	9	2017
Lee College	Criminal Justice & Corrections	AAS	23	18	19	2017
Temple College	Biology Technician/Biotechnology Laboratory Technician	AAS	9	8	7	--
Texarkana College	Marketing	AAS	0	0	0	2017
Wharton County Junior College	Graphic Communications	AAS	8	13	20	2017
Alamo Community College District						
Alamo Community College District - St. Philip's College	Computer Programming	AAS	13	16	20	--
Howard County Junior College District						
Howard College-Southwest Collegiate Institute for the Deaf	American Sign Language	AAS	24	21	19	--

<sup>1</sup> Year of LPP Report with which a low-producing program was first recommended for consolidation or closure. Programs without a year, indicated by dashes (--), are currently not recommended for closure or consolidation.

List of Low-Producing Programs Identified for Three or More Consecutive Years Academic Year 2020 Review			Review Year			First Year of Recommendation
			AY 18	AY 19	AY 20	
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five-Year Periods			
Texas State Technical College District						
Texas State Technical College in Harlingen	Computer Programming	AAS	24	20	16	--
Texas State Technical College in Harlingen	Emergency Medical Technology/Technician (EMT Paramedic)	AAS	0	0	2	--
Texas State Technical College in Marshall	Computer Software and Media Applications	AAS	21	16	10	--
Texas State Technical College in Waco	Graphic Communications	AAS	19	18	17	--
Texas State Technical College in Waco	Building/Construction Finishing, Management, and Inspection	AAS	7	10	18	2017
Texas State Technical College in West Texas	Computer Programming	AAS	24	15	8	--
Non-System - Universities						
Midwestern State University	Instructional Design and Technology	MED	8	6	4	--
Midwestern State University	Humanities	BA	10	9	9	2019
Midwestern State University	Global Studies	BA	21	22	17	2019
Midwestern State University	Political Science	MA	13	13	12	2019
Stephen F. Austin State University	Forestry	PHD	7	8	7	2017
Stephen F. Austin State University	School Mathematics Teaching	MS	5	8	9	2017
Stephen F. Austin State University	Philosophy	BA	17	15	11	2019
Stephen F. Austin State University	Economics	BA	12	12	8	2017
Texas Southern University	Spanish	BA	21	19	17	2017
Texas Southern University	Mathematics	MS	3	2	0	--
Texas Southern University	Art	BA	20	13	19	2017
Texas Woman's University	Family and Consumer Sciences	BS	18	19	20	2019
Texas Woman's University	Food Science and Flavor Chemistry	MS	12	10	2	--
Texas Woman's University	Medical Technology	BS	7	12	14	2017

Low-Producing Programs Identified for Three or More Consecutive Years Academic Year 2020 Review			Review Year			First Year of Recommendation
			AY 18	AY 19	AY 20	
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five-Year Periods			
Texas A&M University System						
Prairie View A&M University	Clinical Adolescent Psychology	PHD	9	5	4	2017
Tarleton State University	History	MA	13	8	8	2019
Texas A&M International University	Bilingual Education	MS	6	2	6	2019
Texas A&M University	Animal Breeding/Physiology of Reproduction	PhD	9	8	9	--
Texas A&M University joint with Texas A&M University System Health Science Center	Oral Biology	PhD	2	4	7	--
Texas A&M University-Commerce	Sport and Recreation Management	BS	0	0	0	--
Texas A&M University-Kingsville	General Business Administration	BBA	20	17	15	--
Texas A&M University-Texarkana	School Counseling	MS	12	11	8	--
West Texas A&M University	Art	BA/BS	18	18	18	2017
West Texas A&M University	Studio Art	MFA	11	11	10	2017
Texas State University System						
Lamar State College-Port Arthur	Computer Programming	AAS	13	23	22	--
Lamar State College-Port Arthur	Mental and Social Health Services and Allied Professions	AAS	11	18	17	2017
Lamar University	Environmental Studies	MS	7	4	6	2017
Lamar University	General Business-Advertising	BBA	14	13	12	2017
Lamar University	General Business-Retail Merchandising	BBA	1	3	3	2017
Lamar University	Biochemistry	BA	7	10	8	2019
Lamar University	Forensic Chemistry	BS	6	4	4	2019
Lamar University	Music-Music Business	BA	0	0	0	2019
Lamar University	Nutrition	BS	0	0	0	--
Lamar University	History	MA	6	10	14	2017
Sam Houston State University	Family and Consumer Sciences	MS	11	9	7	2017
Sam Houston State University	Composite Science	BS	0	0	0	2017
Sam Houston State University	Philosophy	BA	23	22	18	2019
Sam Houston State University	Psychology	MA	1	6	11	2019

Low-Producing Programs Identified for Three or More Consecutive Years Academic Year 2020 Review			Review Year			First Year of Recommendation
			AY 18	AY 19	AY 20	
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five-Year Periods			
Texas State University System						
Sul Ross State University	Industrial Technology	BS	3	5	5	2017
Sul Ross State University	Spanish	BA	8	8	6	2017
Sul Ross State University	English	BA	24	22	19	--
Sul Ross State University	Theatre	BFA	17	15	14	2017
Sul Ross State University	Biology	MS	13	13	14	2019
Sul Ross State University	Mathematics	BS	16	10	12	2017
Sul Ross State University	Chemistry	BS	1	1	3	2017
Sul Ross State University	Psychology	MA	0	0	0	2017
Sul Ross State University	Social Science	BA	7	3	3	2017
Sul Ross State University	Political Science	BA	7	6	7	2017
Sul Ross State University	Political Science	MA	3	2	2	2017
Sul Ross State University	Art	BFA	10	11	11	2017
Sul Ross State University	Art	MA	5	6	6	2017
Sul Ross State University	Music	BM/BA	11	13	11	2017
Sul Ross State University Rio Grande College	Reading Specialist	MED	1	3	6	2017
Sul Ross State University Rio Grande College	Biology	BS	20	19	20	2019
Sul Ross State University Rio Grande College	Mathematics	BS	17	17	19	2019
Sul Ross State University Rio Grande College	Social Science	BA	22	18	16	2017
Texas State University	Software Engineering	MS	13	11	11	--
Texas Tech University System						
Texas Tech University	Land Use Planning, Management, and Design	PHD	4	4	4	2017
Texas Tech University	Secondary Education	MED	12	6	1	--
Texas Tech University	Microbiology	MS	9	8	6	2017
Texas Tech University	Interdisciplinary Arts Studies	BA	0	0	3	2019

Low-Producing Programs Identified for Three or More Consecutive Years Academic Year 2020 Review			Review Year			First Year of Recommendation
			AY 18	AY 19	AY 20	
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five-Year Periods			
The University of Texas System						
The University of Texas at Austin	Architectural Studies	MSAS	3	4	4	--
The University of Texas at Austin	Architectural History	MA	7	3	3	2017
The University of Texas at Austin	Latin American Studies	PHD	4	4	5	2017
The University of Texas at Austin	German, Scandinavian, and Dutch Studies	BA	4	5	4	2017
The University of Texas at Austin	Italian Studies	BA	19	20	18	2017
The University of Texas at Austin	Portuguese	BA	16	16	13	--
The University of Texas at Austin	Architecture	PHD	8	9	7	2019
The University of Texas at Austin	Jewish Studies	BA	8	6	4	2017
The University of Texas at Austin	Dance	MFA	1	1	1	2017
The University of Texas at Austin	Music Composition	BM	8	10	9	2017
The University of Texas at Austin	Jazz	BM	17	22	20	2017
The University of Texas at Dallas	Bioinformatics and Computational Biology	MS	10	8	13	2017
The University of Texas at El Paso	Education	MA	7	7	5	2017
The University of Texas at El Paso	Geophysics <sup>2</sup>	BS	5	3	2	--
The University of Texas at San Antonio	American Studies	BA	22	19	14	--
The University of Texas at San Antonio	Neurobiology	PHD	8	7	7	2019
The University of Texas at San Antonio	Art History	MA	14	13	9	--
The University of Texas at Tyler	Criminal Justice	MS	13	6	7	--

<sup>2</sup> Program reinstated June 1, 2016. Not recommended for closure.

Low-Producing Programs Identified for Three or More Consecutive Years Academic Year 2020 Review			Review Year			First Year of Recommendation
			AY 18	AY 19	AY 20	
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five-Year Periods			
The University of Texas System						
The University of Texas Health Science Center at Houston joint with The University of Texas M.D. Anderson Cancer Center	Biomedical Sciences-Quantitative Sciences <sup>3</sup>	PHD	0	0	0	--
The University of Texas Health Science Center at San Antonio	Personalized Molecular Medicine	MS	2	1	0	2019
The University of Texas Health Science Center at San Antonio	Medical Health Physics	MS	10	8	3	2019
The University of Texas Medical Branch at Galveston	Medical Science Research	MMS	9	9	14	2017
The University of Texas Medical Branch at Galveston	Population Health Sciences	MS	2	2	1	--
The University of Texas of the Permian Basin	Information Systems	BS	22	22	23	2017
The University of Texas of the Permian Basin	Biology	MS	8	8	5	2019
The University of Texas of the Permian Basin	Leadership Studies	BA	9	6	3	2017
The University of Texas of the Permian Basin	Criminal Justice Administration	MS	14	12	8	--
The University of Texas of the Permian Basin	Athletic Training	BS	9	11	11	--
The University of Texas of the Permian Basin	Economics	BA	19	16	21	--
The University of Texas of the Permian Basin	History	MA	13	12	8	--

<sup>3</sup> Reporting caused the actual number of graduates not to be reflected accurately in the data base of program graduates. The program is not recommended for closure.

<b>Low-Producing Programs Identified for Three or More Consecutive Years</b> Academic Year 2020 Review			Review Year			First Year of Recommendation
			AY 18	AY 19	AY 20	
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five-Year Periods			
University of Houston System						
University of Houston	Space Architecture	MS	3	2	0	2019
University of Houston	Engineering Management	MEMGMT	1	0	0	2017
University of Houston	Pharmacology	MS	1	1	1	--
University of Houston-Clear Lake	Reading	MS	14	10	9	--
University of North Texas System						
University of North Texas	Behavioral Sciences	PHD	7	8	8	2017
University of North Texas	Nonprofit Leadership Studies	BS	12	0	0	--